

Larrakia Dreaming -

“The man who was named after a butcher shop”



Above: Chinute Chinute. Bronze casting by Richard Barnes, 2009.
Darwin Waterfront Precinct Walkway

Richard Koolpingah Barnes

An essay written by William B Day PhD

Consulting Anthropologist

2009 (revised 2011)



Koolpinyah Richard Barnes

Chinute Chinute

2009

Bronze casting by Urban Art Projects

Chinute Chinute is a Larrakia spiritual ancestor who exists within the sacred site known as Stokes Hill adjacent to this walkway. This ancestor manifests itself from time to time as the Tawny Frogmouth and stands as sentinel to the Waterfront area.

 TOGA GROUP

 DARWINWATERFRONT

Above: Plaque on sculpture of Chinute Chinute

‘The man who was named after a butcher shop’ –
Richard ‘Koolpinyah’ Barnes and the late George Munggalu

by William B Day PhD
Consulting Anthropologist
August 2009
Revised November 2011

Introduction

The claims by Richard Barnes that he has the authority to speak on behalf of Larrakia people has caused consternation, particularly amongst members of the Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation, established as the representative body for Larrakia people. Richard Barnes, who calls himself ‘Koolpinyah’, claims that he was given the authority to speak ‘on matters of law in relation to Larrakia’ by an elder named George Munggalu and in writing by ‘senior Larrakia people’. The media has largely accepted these statements, given credence by his role in more recent times as Chairman of the Larrakia Development Corporation. In addition, his pro-development stance finds favour with the mainstream press and the NT Government. As a result, the claims made by Richard Barnes to be the successor to Larrakia knowledge have not been critically examined in detail outside the courts.

This essay is a preliminary anthropological investigation into the claims made by Richard Barnes regarding his ‘anointing’ by his ‘uncle’, the late George Munggalu. Research done for the exhaustive Kenbi Land Claim and the Larrakia native title claim to Darwin has provided useful information. The Cubillo family history written by the late Inez Cubillo-Carter is another revealing source. After presenting the evidence in a fairly uncritical manner, a conclusion to this essay offers an anthropologist’s opinion, while acknowledging the dedicated work since the 1980s by Richard Barnes towards the advancement of the Larrakia people. The historian Sam Wells (2001:187) writes:

Richard [Barnes] has been active in land claim matters. He is also an established artist and academic, receiving his Masters of Fine Arts from the Northern Territory University in 2000. Richard is highly skilled in martial arts and has reached the highest black belt rank in Aikido in the Northern Territory.¹ Richard is the Northern Territory chief instructor in Aikido and has taught the art on a voluntary basis in the Northern Territory continually since 1963. Richard’s younger brother, Bernie Devine, is a champion power lifter and is listed in the Guinness Book of Records.²

Rather than detracting from his work, it is intended that this essay should be a corrective to his more extreme claims, and in doing so, situating the various Larrakia corporate bodies in the context of the customary laws, rights and interests of the Larrakia people.

The welcome speech

At the opening of the first session of the Eleventh Assembly in the Northern Territory Legislative Assembly on Tuesday September 2008, the Clerk welcomed ‘Koolpinyah Barnes, senior Larrakia elder, to present a welcome to country, accompanied by Kenbi Dancers’ (NT Hansard 2008). Mr Barnes opened his address by saying:

I am here to speak to you and welcome you on behalf of my people, the Larrakia people. I have been given this authority in two ways, one from my uncle who has now passed away some time ago – he anointed me in the traditional way and gave me the right to speak. The other way is in a document that has been signed by senior Larrakia people saying that I can speak on behalf of the Larrakia, and speak on matters of law in relation to Larrakia. They did that because they knew of that original arrangement with my uncle.

A full page notice in the *Northern Territory News* (June 5, 2008, p.4) expands this assertion with additional comment:

Chairman of the Larrakia Development Corporation, Koolpinyah Richard Barnes, is regularly consulted by the Aboriginal Areas Protection Authority regarding sacred sites in Larrakia country, knowing he has been asked to do this by the most senior Larrakia Ceremony man and that this cultural authority was confirmed in writing by Senior Larrakia Elders.³

Fortunately the process of Richard Barnes acquiring knowledge and the history of his involvement in Larrakia affairs is documented in a variety of sources, as is his relationship to George Munggalu. From these sources, conclusions can be drawn to confirm or deny his right to ‘speak on behalf of the Larrakia’.

In a history of the Cubillo family, *Keeper of Stories*, Richard Barnes is described as ‘Great Great grandson of George McKeddie and Annie (Duwun) and the grandson of Cristina Cubillo Odegaard’. The description continues:⁴

... It was through Uncle Delfin that Richard became aware of his Aboriginal heritage and his life was enriched by the Larrakia Dreamtime stories that he told him. When Richard grew up and the time was right, Uncle Defin introduced him to George Munggaloo, another Uncle and senior ceremony leader of the Larrakia (Carter-Cubillo 1996:155).

In the Kenbi Land Claim book, George Munggalu is listed as a person related to other Larrakia through marriage (Brandl et al 1979:47-48). Barnes names George Munggalu as being ‘my uncle, *Ungya*, my mother’s brother, [who] is my uncle on my mother’s side’. A genealogical chart demonstrates his relationship by marriage (Brandl et al 1979:41).

In 1910 Juan Cubillo [sic] married Lily McKeddie, daughter of an early settler on the Cox Peninsula – George McKeddie – and a Larrakia woman named Annie, who came from the Belyuen area. Lily’s brother, Jack McKeddie, married Victoria Dashwood, sister of George Munggalu, the most senior ritual man in the claim area today.⁵

Inez Cubillo-Carter quotes from a statement, ‘Our Larrakia Story’, written as evidence for the Kenbi Land Claim:

...great grandfather George McKeddie and his Larrakia partner Annie (Duwun) met at Southport and he honoured that relationship/marriage and his family from that association until the day he died in 1927. Lily their first born was born at Southport 1880 and when Southport closed down 1889 great grandfather George moved his family Annie, daughter Lily and his old trusted friend Ah Yung (Chinese cook) [to] a place called Delissaville ... Great grandfather McKeddie made regular trips to Delissaville and a second child Jack was born in 1892 (Cubillo-Carter 2000:140).⁶

However, the list of half-castes gives Lily's age as 14 years and Jack's age as 7 years, making a difference of 7 years, not the 19 years in the above extract by Inez Cubillo-Carter.

Who was Annie?

Various words are used to describe the relationship between George McKeddie and Annie. 'Partner/marriage' (above), 'relationship' (Avery 1997:134), or the more romantic description of 'took an Aboriginal bride' (Gary Lang cited in Avery 1997:139). The 'List of Half Casts [sic] in the Northern Territory' lists 'Jack - male, 7 years, mother - Maggie, Mother's tribe - South Port, Reputed father's name - G McKeddie' and adds the remarks: 'Half cast Jack lives with the blacks on P R Allen's premises, he is poorly grown, appears to be well fed and a fair amount of clothing.'⁷ McKeddie is also listed as the reputed father of 'Lilly, female, 14 years, Mother's name - Minnie, Mother's tribe - South Port.'. Annie's name is not mentioned as the mother of McKeddie's reputed two children.

The obituary of George McKeddie published in the *NT Times* on April 8th, 1927 does not mention his children, only stating: 'The last surviving relatives are his brother, Mr J McKeddie of Malvern, Victoria, well known in the NT in the early days, his sister Mrs J Grant of Kew, Victoria and a number of nephews and nieces, grand nephews and grand nieces' (Cubillo-Carter 2000:25). Considering that George McKeddie was a substantial member of the community, including being appointed JP and member of the Palmerston District Council, in those days he would be highly unlikely to acknowledge his Aboriginal children in any significant way. Concerning Lily, under 'Remarks', the 'List of Half Casts [sic] in the Northern Territory' comments: 'Half cast Lilly is living with a Manila man named Antonio at the old ice house on the beach, She appears to be well fed and clothed for further particulars see report.'⁸ The image of a fourteen-year-old 'half caste' girl living on the beach with a 'Manila Man' is difficult to reconcile with the more recent romanticised descriptions given by the McKeddie descendants but is more reminiscent of scenes from Xavier Herbert's novel, *Capricornia*.

Mansfield (2006:156) discussed evidence from 'The List of Half Castes' recording 'Minnie' as the mother of Lily. Mansfield does not discuss the identity of 'Maggie' who the list records as the mother of Jack. It appears that the evidence before Mansfield relied on specific physical similarities inherited by the Odegaard family shared by an old photograph of an Aboriginal girl named 'Minnie' and stories said to be passed on by unrelated elders.⁹ Mansfield wrote:

Richard Barnes gave evidence that he did not know his great great grandmother's Aboriginal name until 1986 when he was told by Roy Kelly, an Aboriginal man living at 10 Mile. Roy Kelly was said to have told Richard Barnes that George McKeddie was married to Annie Duwun. Richard Barnes said that Roy Kelly knew Annie's name because a member of his own community had the same name, and that this information concerning Annie was confirmed by an elderly Malak Malak woman, Granny Pan Que. In the 1989 Kenbi Claim proceedings, Richard Barnes did not refer to Granny Pan Que's corroboration of the information.¹⁰

Richard Barnes also relied upon a photo, taken by Foelsche in 1878, which showed a fifteen-year old

Aboriginal woman named 'Minnie', who apparently resembled Lily Magdalena McKeddie, and who seemed to suffer from a physical defect affecting her right eye. Richard Barnes gave evidence that certain members of his family also suffered from problems with their right eye.

In summary, Mansfield (2006:154) cites the argument by the Northern Territory representative:

The Territory submitted that knowledge about the existence of Annie Duwun was not handed down through the Cubillo family, and that which had been handed down, at its highest, was merely that their ancestor was 'an Aboriginal woman, possibly called Annie, who was married to George McKeddie and lived with him at Belyuen'. The Territory relied on confusion amongst family members as to Annie Duwun's date and location of death, and that the family did not know of her Aboriginal name until Richard Barnes conducted research. It was also submitted that Richard Barnes was an unreliable witness given apparent inconsistencies in his evidence

According to the 1964 census recorded in the Aboriginal Population Records held in the National Archives of Australia, Darwin Office (CRS E944/0), an old age pensioner named 'Annie Juwun', born in 1905, 'Nanagu group', was residing at the 'Ten Mile' on 27th October, 1964. The census states that Annie's tribe was 'Malak Malak'. Her partner in 1964 was 'Alfie Miwulajj', a Larrakia man born in 1895, widower of Elsie (deceased).¹¹

The Cubillo history (Cubillo-Carter 2000:12) notes that Antonio [Cubillo] married Magdalena (Lily), the daughter of George McKeddie and Annie. Antonio and Lily subsequently had ten children.¹² Inez Cubillo-Carter (2000:138) states that through the relationship between Lily's brother, Jack McKeddie, and Victoria Dashwood, Victoria's brother George Munggalu 'was just like family and there was always that closeness with Magdalena, Ana and Delfin right throughout their life, especially her brother Delfin'. However, the anthropologist's report uses the term 'sister' in quotation marks as if to raise doubts that Victoria Dashwood was the consanguine full sister of George Munggalu. The Cubillo genealogy in the Kenbi Land Claim Book (Brandl et al 1979:52) shows that George Munggalu had a deceased sister named Victoria while the genealogy of 'People with an interest in the claim area through ceremonial leadership' shows only two deceased brothers (Brandl et al 1979:41).

George Munggalu's 'sister', Vicky Dashwood¹³

In a summary of evidence before Mr Justice Gray, Mary Lee is quoted as saying 'she learned she was Larrakia through her father's uncle's wife Vicky Dashwood' (Avery 1997:141). Ms Lee said:

At the time Vicky Dashwood repeatedly told me that I was to call her aunty because she was Larrakia and I was Larrakia. My father [used] to be a shift-worker on the wharf ... and just once a week we would go to the pictures together, but it was mainly Aunty Vicky, those times, that she told me that we were Larrakia, but being very small I can just remember that ... the link was cut off with my father when he died, and Vicky Dashwood, she was no longer around, and then my Uncle Delfin took over the role – like the Aboriginal way, big brother – and he told us that we were Larrakia.

In a footnote, the anthropologist's report states that Kathleen Cubillo is cited as saying that Vicky Dashwood would only say she was Aboriginal (Avery 1997:141). Kathleen expanded on her search for identity in her evidence to Mr Justice Gray (Avery 1997:142-143):

Kathleen Cubillo: ...when old Auntie Vicky Dashwood used to come up and say, 'Oh, my girl, I'm your Auntie. Give me a kiss,' and I would say to mum, 'Is she my Auntie?' and mum would say, 'Oh, don't go near her,' because she was always slightly inebriated, but I would say, yes, her attitude had changed---

Mr Parsons: Yes.

Kathleen Cubillo:--- definitely towards – because, you know, we were going to school with Aboriginal kids – with other – other kids, and you would say to her, 'Are we Aboriginal, mum?' and she would not answer. So you would take that as a yes, because that was the type of woman mum was.

George Munggalu

In his welcome, Barnes then describes how his 'uncle' George Munggalu lived under a banyan tree on The Esplanade in Darwin 'in the early days'.¹⁴ 'He was there with his brother-in-law, his wife and his brother-in-law's wife and the children'. The Cubillo family history describes how George Munggalu and his sister were cared for by the Edwards family in Darwin and later at Newcastle Waters station:

George Munggaloo used to live with Jack and Vicky at Delissaville (Belyuen). As a young man growing up George and his sister Victoria worked for old Mr Roy Edwards. Mr Edwards had a beautiful home and a lovely big yacht in his yard at Kahlin. Victoria and George were well looked after in return for their loyal and good work, they were never hungry and always had decent clothes as long as Roy Edwards was alive George Munggaloo was part of their family. Victoria would take off but George always stayed (Cubillo-Carter 2000:138).

Discussing the multi-faceted identities of claimants in the Kenbi land claim, Brandl et al (1979:34-35) document how George Munggalu gained ceremonial responsibilities amongst the Larrakia, although he was not a Larrakia by inheritance. Perhaps this is why Barnes said during the opening of Parliament, '...we are related to a lot of people who were across our borders'. He names Tiwi, Wulna people across the Adelaide River and the Malingin further over that way. We are related to the Wadjigan people and others from that area out that way'. In the Kenbi land claim report Brandl et al (1979:34) state:

[George Munggalu] was born in Darwin, that his father's 'country' is Banagaya, on the southern side of the mouth of the Daly River and that his *durlg* is sea-monster (whale), or rainbow. His mother's language was Djeraidj. He was initiated at Bilurrigwa at Shoal Bay east of Darwin by men of the *danggalaba* clan of the Larrakia linguistic grouping. He advanced through their ceremonies until he reached *dariba* status and took over the responsibility for holding ceremonies. He has lived for many years with his friend, Roy Edwards, a pastoralist at Newcastle Waters.

The Kenbi claim book further explains that Munggalu is listed as a person with an interest in land in the claim area because of his role in 'ceremonial initiation and progression' (Brandl et al 1979:40).

Roy Edwards - 'A rich old turd'

Ted Egan worked as a teacher in a one-teacher school on Newcastle Waters in the 1960s. Apart from his own children, his twenty Aboriginal pupils came from 'the vast 3000 square mile Newcastle Waters cattle station' owned by Roy Edwards who Egan knew from Darwin. Using disdainful language, Egan describes Roy Edwards as 'a rich old turd' with a 'fortress mentality [who] didn't deserve company anyway' (Egan 1997:209). The manager of the station and his wife became good friends of the Egan family but 'like the Aboriginals, were not allowed to have visitors'. According to Ted Egan, 'It was a strict, unhappy life on the station for the Aboriginal people'. Egan adds: 'You'd never believe this, but Roy Edwards was so paranoid about outsiders that he wouldn't sell beef to any local people', despite running about 40,000 head of cattle on the station at the time (Egan 1997:211).

Ted Egan's negative view of Roy Edwards is confirmed by a researcher on the Dum-in-mirrie claim which preceded the Kenbi land claim. The anthropologist Adrienne Haritos (as she was in 1979) writes:

Often we (the Kenbi researchers) would ask about sites and ceremonies on the Cox Peninsula and the reply would be (from people like Roy Mitpul, John Bianamu, Maudie Bennett) that you had to speak to George Munggalu. So Olga [Lyons] and I made a trip to Tennant Creek [on 20th January 1979] where we hired a car and drove to Newcastle Waters. There we had an unkind welcome from Roy Edwards who began by slagging off my father. We did get to speak to George, but it was the most difficult and stilted conversation with Roy Edwards' stern and unpleasant presence causing some stress. Later in Darwin we had more conversations with George in better circumstances and Maria [Brandl] especially was able to elicit much info helpful to the Kenbi Claim (Adrienne McConvell [nee Haritos] personal communication, September 2009).

Descendants of Christine Cubillo

The Consultant Anthropologist's Report to the Aboriginal Land Commissioner, Mr Justice Gray, gives further insight into Richard Barnes's induction into all things Larrakia. Under the heading 'Descendants of Christine Cubillo' the anthropologist relates that 'Christine Cubillo had five children all of who were alive in 1989' (Avery 1997:135). According to the evidence of Christine's daughter, Florence Devine, Florence was born in Darwin in 1919 and was taken to Thursday Island by her mother where they remained for ten years. Then after three years back in Darwin, Florence was placed in a convent until she was nineteen. After Florence gave birth to her son, Richard Barnes, in Darwin in 1941 the family were evacuated to Adelaide where she had three more children in the 1950s. On her return to Darwin, Florence worked for twenty-one years in the Darwin Hospital.

The consulting anthropologist described Richard Barnes as 'the main witness for this family' (Avery 1997:135). The report then gives some background followed by the transcript of Mr Parsons' cross questioning:

Soon after Richard Barnes was born he was evacuated with his mother [and] lived for about ten years in Adelaide before returning to Darwin in 1952. In 1964 Richard Barnes was employed by the Northern Territory public service and has remained a public servant. In 1975 he began visiting the

Islands now under claim by boat with his father, Ken Barnes, who is not Aboriginal. This was for fishing. He did not visit Belyuen or any other sites on the Cox Peninsula until later.

Becoming involved in the Kenbi Land Claim

In 1989 Richard Barnes said he became involved in the Kenbi Land Claim in about 1981-2. The transcript cites his explanation:

Mr Parsons: ... Perhaps we can first of all ask you about your involvement in the land claim.

Richard Barnes: Yes.

Mr Parsons: And I guess in matters on behalf of Larrakia. When did you become involved and why?

Richard Barnes: I got involved about eight years ago. The reason I got involved is I got into conversation with my Uncle Delfin, and I had not heard a lot about the land claim at the time and he told me something about it because he had been involved with it earlier, a number of years earlier. And he explained what he had done about it and asked if I would be interested in helping, and once I knew what it was about I agreed to help.

Mr Parsons: Prior to then, had you been involved with any Larrakia issues that - or anything to do with Larrakia land?

Richard Barnes: No. I have not been involved with any – anything to do with Larrakia business as such. I - - -

Mr Parsons: Why was that do you think?

Richard Barnes; I did not – I do not think there was anything going on. I did not know about anything that was happening. The – before the land rights came into being there was not really much that Aboriginal people could do to acquire land or look after land or anything like that. It just was not much said about it. There did not seem to be any process for doing it.

I always knew from early days I was Larrakia but it did not – did not seem necessary to do – do anything about it because from a personal point of view, I know this is Larrakia land here. I know it is Larrakia land in Darwin and there is not really anything that anybody can do to change that. It will be always be that way.

That is the way I feel it inside. In those early days there did not seem to be a process for winning land back or doing anything like that so there did not seem to be any way to get involved in doing things for Larrakia.

Mr Parsons: Well, since your involvement, what kind of involvement had it become – what things?

Richard Barnes: Well, I have been fully committed to winning this land claim for the – for my people and for other interested people. The – there are different organisations that I got involved with, the - I got involved with the legal aid as a council member so that I can represent Larrakia people in that area.

I got - I helped form the Larrakia Association so that the association could be an area where people could bring problems and discuss things so that we could sort them out. I was elected to the land council – the Northern Land Council. – as a member, as a Larrakia member, and I used that forum for presenting Larrakia problems and to push the Larrakia land claim (1022-3) (Avery 1997:135-136).

The anthropologist's report (p.138) quotes Richard Barnes's explanation why he was now learning about the places on the Cox Peninsula:

Richard Barnes: I do not believe there has been an opportunity before the Kenbi Land Claim came up. There has been an opportunity to do something about the country. It is always seen as being taken over by other people and not really much can be done about it. I feel that maybe a lot of people felt they had lost the country, the same as they have lost all of Darwin because it was occupied, they lost this area also, and there was no means of getting the country back until something like the Land Rights Act came into being and there was a possibility of making a claim on it.

The consultant anthropologist concludes that the statement by Barnes suggests that 'that the group descended from Annie Duwun was formed after 1982 for the purposes of the land claim'.

Learning about Larrakia ways

Further background to the involvement of Richard Barnes is given by Avery (1997) on page 137:

Richard Barnes has been assiduous in his quest to learn the traditions of the Larrakia people. His main teacher was George Munggulu [sic], a Wadjigiyn man who went to work for Roy Edwards on Newcastle Waters Station, only returning to Darwin when Roy Edwards retired. He then lived at One Mile Dam close to the centre of Darwin...

Richard Barnes visited him there over a three year period, providing him with food on occasions, until George Munggulu died in about 1985 (4690, 4708). Richard Barnes called George Munggulu 'uncle' possibly partly based on the fact that Richard's great-grandmother's brother, Jack McKeddie married a 'sister' of George Munggulu. However, the relationship between Richard Barnes and George Munggulu, so far as Richard was concerned was primarily for him to learn about Larrakia ways. Richard Barnes said this was not because of the land claim (4744-5). However, it is clear that the relationship was of narrow scope even in relation to Aboriginal matters (see 4710).

Richard Barnes could not recall whether this conversation with Delphin Cubillo [sic] about the land claim occurred before or after he first saw the 1979 Claim Book, which Richard Barnes saw 'probably when it first came out or maybe a year after or something like that' (4715). However, Richard Barnes said neither Delphin Cubillo nor George Munggulu knew the name of Annie Duwun.

Before 1982 then, it is unlikely that Richard Barnes had any significant knowledge of Larrakia traditions or other Aboriginal matters. Although his uncle Delphin Cubillo had been involved in the Darwin Aboriginal movement to protect Gundal at Emery Point and to obtain land in Darwin, Richard Barnes said he had no knowledge of this activity at the time. He first became aware of it in about 1982 (4741-3, see also 4745).

The campaign to save Duwun, 1973

The connection made between the Cubillos, Annie Duwun and Quail Island is interesting. The late Inez Cubillo and her son Gary Lang reputedly became emotional when passing Duwun (Quail Island), because, according to Inez 'Annie Duwun, [Gary's] great-great-grandmother, was born on Duwun, and it had been bombed' (Avery 1997:140).¹⁵ Considering the supposed importance of Duwun, or Quail Island, to the Cubillo descendants of Annie (including Richard Barnes), it is surprising that none of the group spoke out publicly during the 1973 campaign to stop RAAF bombing practice on Quail Island. Ward McNally includes

several pages on the protest and a photograph of the 'Wagait' campers in his book, *The Angry Australians* (McNally 1974:53-56). He reports: '...in mid-November four members of the Wagait tribe went to Quail Island, a hip of land about forty miles down the coastline and to the left of Darwin, and took up residence in an effort to stop the bombing of sacred tribal land by Australian and British air force planes' (see also Day [1994:94]).

Under the Page 2 headline, 'Island squatters defy RAF bombers' *The Northern Territory News* reported:

The battle lines have been drawn on Quail Island ... 'We want to make a protest,' their leader, Roy Mudpool explained ... We don't want any more bombing here. We hope that the protest might do something. Of course the air force might not take any notice of us. We will just have to wait and see' (*NT News*, November 13 and 14, 1973).

In fact, the air force delayed the bombing until the four men had left the island – meanwhile the protestors had successfully publicised the issue nationally and caused Senators to ask questions in Canberra.

On page 145 of his report, the consultant anthropologist concludes:

As a group the Cubillo family's knowledge of the Aboriginal geography and traditions of the Cox Peninsula and the Islands, that pre-date the 1989 hearings, was not great. They base their claims on inheritance from Annie Duwun, the great-grandmother or greater [sic] of the senior witnesses. The Cubillo family is united under her name ... Of course none of them knew Annie Duwun and few knew her daughter. Indeed, Annie Duwun's name appears not to have been reinstated widely until the 1980s. It is now family lore that she was Larrakia but it cannot be taken for granted that this was a simple fact during her life. The retrospective element in Annie Duwun's identity and status would weaken any case the Cubillo family had for inheritance from her.

The man who is named after a butcher shop

Barnes concluded his speech at the opening of the NT Legislative Assembly by relating how George Munggalu once introduced him as 'The man who has been named after a butcher shop' (Hansard September 9, 2008) 'because Koolpinyah Station had a butcher shop in town and he thought that is where the name came from'. However, the Koolpinya butcher shop was part owned by George's long time 'boss', Roy Edwards, according to Douglas Lockwood, so George Munggalu would be well aware of the meaning of the name. In a map of the Darwin Central Business District 1948-1954 Ted Egan (1997 insert) lists the 'Koolpinya Kool Store' as being in Smith Street opposite the Victoria Hotel.

Barnes refers to Douglas Lockwood's book 'about the bombing of Darwin'. Barnes claims that Lockwood 'talked about this man [Munggalu] organising the Aboriginal people in Darwin so that he could place them in a safe place during the bombing'. In *Australia's Pearl Harbour: Darwin 1942*, Lockwood (1966:122) describes how Roy Edwards sheltered from the bombing 'at his Koolpinyah butchery' while his wife Ash was alone at their home on The Esplanade 'except for an aboriginal factotum, George Mungalo'. According to Lockwood (1966:123), Edwards was the only man in Darwin who owned a private aeroplane but when he and his wife reached the airport after the bombing, they found the plane riddled with machine gun bullets and 'had to go on the evacuee train'.

Later in his book, Lockwood (1966:179) gives a fuller account of George Munggalu's role after the bombing of Darwin on February 19th, 1942. Lockwood recounts:

George Mungalo, of the Larrakia tribe recalls: 'I was working in the pearl shed for my boss, Roy Edwards. I was packing shell ... I run into the house to my missus, Ash Edwards, and I say, 'Look out missus, bombs coming now.' Roy's not there, see; he's up the town. I grabbed Ash and I took her to the trench and we got in it together ... Oh, yes, I'm frightened all right, but I'm not frightened for myself, only for my missus.

I been with the Edwards family since me little-bit kid. I born there on Lameroo Beach, right in from of out house, and I don't want that house to be finish or my missus to be finish. I properly frightened for her. After Japan-man fly away I run up town and find my boss, Roy, and I tell him Japan-man bin come. He knows alright. I filled up car with petrol and they going away. I'm singing them away. 'Don't worry about me, missus, boss,' I say. "Me stop here and look out for house.'

That night all Larakia people come together. Tommy Imabul there. Peter Edwards there. Billy Shepherd there. Chook-Chook too. Bob Secretary he owns Darwin, he the big boss of all this land, it belong to his father before, and that one's father before, before the white man come. We go down to Lameroo Beach, that where I born, for council meeting. 'Don't move. We stay here,' I say.

Lockwood (1966:179) then describes how the Native Affairs officer, Bill Harney, advised the Aboriginal people on Lameroo Beach to go to the Aboriginal settlement at Delissaville, a three day walk for Munggalu and his companions. The courageous role of Darwin's Aboriginal residents in World War II has scarcely been acknowledged and George Munggalu was no exception; however, in his Legislative Assembly speech Barnes exaggerated the role his uncle played after the bombing.

A slightly different version of George's experiences was told in a *Northern Territory News* article headed 'Old George and the enemy submarine'. In the 1979 story, Kerry Sharp described George Munggalu, then in his eighties, as 'the oldest surviving member of the Larrakeyah tribe' (*NT News* August 11, 1979). The article describes incidents from George's World War II service in the Aboriginal coast watch, nicknamed the 'Black Watch'. On one occasion when George was stationed in 'a small beach camp at Kabarl at the northern end of Bynoe Harbour' he spotted a Japanese submarine stranded on the southern tip of the island and alerted RAAF fighter planes. The article continues: 'George and a group of his Larrakeyah tribesmen were staying at Doctors Gully the night Darwin was destroyed by Japanese bombs'. From their 'underground shelter in the then outskirts of the city' George watched as 'up to 40 Japanese planes swooped in from the sea'. The article adds that he was also involved in the successful search for a downed American fighter pilot.

In Douglas Lockwood's book, *The Front Door: Darwin, 1869-1969*, the only mention of George Munggalu in the index refers to a paragraph about Bob Secretary (Lockwood 1968:102):

If finders were keepers, Darwin would belong to Gwila-marinya, known as Bob Secretary, of the Larrakia tribe of Australian Aborigines. His tribesman, George Mungalo, says:

Bob Secretary is the big boss of all Darwin. This is his country. It belonged to his father before, and that one's father before him ... before the white man came.

Gundal (Emery Point) - 'Parliament House Here OK'

Continuing his welcome speech in the NT Legislative Assembly, Richard Barnes claimed that George Munggalu taught him many things 'over a three year period'. Barnes said: '...he taught me about the law, he taught me some things that are not done today, because our law – that is, the Larrakia law – only exists with me now and it is not going to pass on'. According to Barnes in his speech, the new laws 'are made in this parliament and they are good laws. They take the place of the social security we had before'.

Referring to the ceremonial ground Gundal at Emery Point, Barnes said: 'Our ceremonies were held where the Army is now. I am still the custodian of that place. I am the senior custodian. The other three custodians have passed away'. Walsh (1989a:11) in *Ten Years On*, a supplement to *The Kenbi Land Claim Book*, seems to confirm Barnes's statement. Discussing Gundal, Walsh claims: 'Richard Barnes, current vice-president of the Larrakia Association, and close associate of George Munggalu before his death, has now taken over responsibility for visiting this site'. Walsh (1989a:11) writes 'one of the ceremonial leaders, George Munggalu, expressed his concern' to the Aboriginal Sacred Sites Authority in 1981 about the Emery Point site, Gundal.¹⁶ Walsh (1989a:11) notes that after further visits to Gundal with George Munggalu and others the Army 'agreed to Aboriginal access [to Gundal] under specific conditions'.

The trustees nominated by the NLC for the Goondal site are recorded in the transcript of proceedings into the Larrakia claim to Emery Point, held before His Honour Mr Justice Ward, the Interim Aboriginal Land Commissioner at Darwin in August 1975. Hugh Bradley for the Northern Land Council advised Judge Ward:¹⁷

The Northern Land Council submits that the lease [to Goondal] should be held by trustees nominated by the Northern Land Council after consultation with interested Aboriginals, and I can indicate to your Honour that the Aboriginals have already considered this problem, and just for Your Honour's interest, the persons presently indicated to be the trustees are Tommy Lyons, Norman Harris and Victor Williams, and it would be essential I think to have some sort of perpetual succession or association to give it perpetual title of the land to prevent any difficulties arising out of the death of one or more of the trustees.

Obviously the succession question was not resolved. As a result, we are led to believe that rights to the site were passed on to Richard Barnes by George Munggalu.¹⁸

In June 1975, George Munggalu became embroiled in a controversy centred on Emery Point. After Cyclone Tracy, when the future of the Larrakeyah Army Barracks was uncertain, the Speaker of the NT Legislative Assembly, Bernie Kilgariff proposed that a new Parliament House be built on Emery Point. To ascertain the feelings of Larrakia people, the Northern Land Council arranged an inspection of the area with several elders on 24th June, 1975. This process was outside the Gundal Land Claim being heard by Mr Justice Ward the same year. A transcript of the site inspection quotes George Munggalu: 'People ask me can we make that

business now. We old fellows nearly finished, we must hurry. Please can you help us get that country and we make business [initiation]'.¹⁹

However, when George was asked 'What do you think about that parliament house we have been talking about?' he answered as follows:²⁰

That parliament house him alright. If that Tommy say so, him boss feller. That alright. You ask that parliament man to make fence, so nobody women can go there. Lady can go around but not that side (indicating dancing and shade area).

Q. Any Larrakeyah left over that went to that business?

A. That Bobby (Secretary) him been that business maybe two times, but not Goondal. Only me and Tommy - Norman and Nipper before that army come, we made business there.

Two days later the elder Norman Harris was interviewed at Gundal. According to the transcript Norman was asked:

Q. Do you know George Mungalow?

A. Yes

Q. Who is older, you or George?

A. Both level.

Q. What about Tommy?

A. He is older.

Q. Now Tommy and George drew me a map of Goondal and showed me where the business is held. Can you have a look at it and tell me if it is true (showed map and explained the story told by George and Tommy).

Q. What do you want to do with that place?

A. We keep him.

Q. What about this area? You know where the women used to put the food for the men and boys, and here where the women used to cross to go fishing and hunting on the other side.

A. Yes that place alright.

Q. Do you think that building Parliament House there is a good or bad thing?

A. That is alright, they can build there.²¹

The Speaker, Bernie Kilgariff, summarised the negotiations in an undated statement:²²

The House Committee was of the opinion that Emery Point was eminently suitable for the purpose of Parliament House and presented a report to the Assembly to that effect. After the adoption of the report by the Assembly I became aware that the area being sought was the subject of the [Larrakia] claim now under discussion and I sought advice from Mr John Wilders of the Northern Land Council (NLC) to the extent of the claim and the significance of the area to Aboriginal people.

Mr Wilders arranged a meeting with some of the Aboriginal people and an inspection of the area on Tuesday, 24 June. From that inspection it became apparent that the area being considered by the Assembly was part of that area being sought by the Aborigines. It appeared from that meeting that although some of the areas were of sacred significance and were needed inviolate as part of the culture of the people it may have been possible for the Assembly to make use of a part of the area and that the security of those areas could be reinforced by the presence of the Parliament House. A further meeting was arranged for 10.00 am on Wednesday, 25 June, at Bagot Reserve.

This meeting was attended by a much larger group including some members of the Bagot Council, the Gwalwa Daraniki and other unidentified parties... Although some of the Aboriginal people, including Mr Bobby Secretary of the Larrakeyah, expressed a need for time to consider the question further, others present were definite in opposition to any suggestion of alienating any of the land within the claim for purposes other than the direct interests of the Aboriginals.

Mr Kilgariff concluded his statement: 'I must admit to some difficulty in establishing who are capable of speaking for the Aboriginal people with rights in this matter.'

At the Bagot meeting, Fred Fogarty arrived with a bulging knapsack to hear Kilgariff address an attentive crowd of concerned Aboriginal people, including the residents from the Kulaluk camp. A large map of Emery Point was spread on a table with a model of the proposed parliament building being moved tentatively across the map. 'Will it be alright if we build Parliament House here?' Bernie Kilgariff asked the respectful audience. Interrupting the polite silence, Fred Fogarty dramatically flung packets of tea, sugar, flour and tobacco across the table. 'You took our land for tea and sugar, now take them back and we will keep our land!' shouted Fred. The spell was broken. In the chaos that followed, Kilgariff packed up his map and no more was ever said about the plan to build Parliament House on Emery Point.

The negotiations over the proposal to build Parliament House on Emery Point are worth discussing in some detail as contemporary records reveal how individuals can be taken aside to reach a position that may not represent the wider opinion of Aboriginal society. For example, after seeing the map released by the NLC in 1975, I wrote to the Interim Aboriginal Land Commissioner:²³ 'On the map prepared by Mr Wilders and Tommy Lyons, is clearly written "Parliament House here OK" which happens to be inside the [Gundal] claim.' In the letter I referred to an earlier inspection on May 14th, 1973:

Dolly Gurinyee was an undisputed old Larrakia lady who died about eighteen months ago. With her nephew, Victor Williams, she showed us the boundary of the area which is close to the line where the claim begins, shaded red. Dolly held a high position amongst the women and would be even more conscious of where the boundary was ... Now Victor Williams and his aunty Dolly were in a unique position of working at the barracks during the war with Japan and were thus able to follow the various changes of the landscape that must have occurred at Emery Point.

The Tommy Lyons connection

In later pages, Brandl et al (1979:171) describe the complex connections whereby Tommy Lyons 'is said by his wife and daughter' to have given his rights to 'call his clan's ceremonies and sing its songs to John Biyanamurrug, a Wadjiginy-language man'. The report adds: 'Biyanamurrug is also the nephew (classificatory son) of George Munggalu now widely acknowledged as the senior ceremonial man for the claim area [Kenbi]'. The report notes (p.171) that Biyanamurrug 'is on that account, too, heir to the *danggalaba* clan knowledge. George Munggalu, in his turn, called Imabulg [Tommy Lyons] 'father'.

In a further discussion of inheritance, Brandl and Walsh (1983:151) give the example of Maudie Bennett who 'has been married to men of both Tiwi and Larrakia language groups'. Brandl and Walsh (1983:151) continue:

Her Larrakia-speaking husband, the now dead Tommy Lyons, or Imabulg, a senior man of the *danggalaba* clan, imparted to her safe-keeping knowledge of sites on the Cox Peninsula and the islands. A lot of their married life was spent together on Indian Island and the Cox Peninsula, which she probably knows better than any other living person. George Munggalu has also passed on his knowledge of the area to her, to be handed on as Tommy Lyons wishes to their daughter Olga. Maudie, too, has attended *danggalaba* and other so-called Larrakia-style initiation ceremonies, and shares knowledge of these with others such as George Munggalu and her uncle Norman Harris, or Barral, another man of senior 'Larrakia' status, but not in the *danggalaba* clan.

Brandl et al (1979:171) give additional information about George Munggalu's wishes for the preservation of his knowledge:

Munggalu takes seriously his responsibility as ceremonial leader to pass on what information he can to Imabulg's daughter, Olga. At the key site of *Wariny* on 1 August 1979 he made a public statement that he was leaving his knowledge of the claim area, including the records we had made of his information to Maudie Bennett and to her daughter Olga, his 'sister: 'They are the bosses now. Anybody who wants to see, ask them.'

In 2009 Robert Wesley-Smith related his own eye-witness account of what appears to be the same event. Wesley-Smith (personal communication) writes:

My friend Adrienne Haritos was involved with taking people around Bynoe Harbour for noting sacred sites etc but the costs was high. I offered my boat, an 8m long narrow boat, for nothing, except fuel. When the day came, there was a strong wind warning, and we decided to tow the boat to Bynoe Harbour, and launch across the beach. So far so good. Two trips to get everyone across to Indian Island, but some discussion of where to anchor it. In the morning it blew up fresh early, and while watching the boat it turned over!! Bloody hell! We rushed down and tipped it right way up, then motored around to the long beach facing slightly west of north.

Anyway, a week of terrific exploring followed. Some times the women, sometimes the men. Towards the end of the week George, a lovely character, was to show us a large square sacred rock, a bit north of where we were, on the mainland. It had been shelled by the Navy as target practice, but was still intact. As we quietly motored close, George stood up, holding me to steady and then holding the edge of the cabin, and spoke in loud and emphatic voice to the rock. Everyone was somewhat stunned, so while the anthropologists scrambled for their tape recorders, I said: 'Hey old man, what is that all about?', or somesuch, being recognised as the skipper only, not as an expert. George said (as I remember from 30 years ago): 'I'm just telling that old man that I am bringing these white fellas to visit him, and is that OK?' Then he spoke again, so I asked again. He said: 'I've told him I have not long to live, and that I'm handing over responsibilities to look after him to this young girl here (Olga).' I think the 3rd speech was to say farewell. Probably the exact words were recorded by the anthropologists. This was quite an experience for all of us I'm sure.

Of course there were other events that stay in my mind. George told me his coast watch story of the Japanese submarine, and how he ran and canoed to the nearest coast watch station, they radioed for an aircraft which came over and probably bombed it to terminal legs. I have often wondered if this was the submarine found south of Cape Fourcroy? In my view it should be dived on to establish such things. I took George to the *NT News* where he told his story, again, no doubt one of many that should have been recorded from our black coast watch friends. Later I widened my boat so it did not

tend to turn over on anchor!! I think all those aboriginal people have died since our trip. Skipper Rob Wesley-Smith.

Olney (1991:35) states: 'The Kenbi claim is somewhat unusual in that the knowledge holders for this country publicly acknowledge that they are not themselves the land owners but hold the knowledge for and on behalf of the land owners. Of special importance are the children of John Singh from his now deceased first wife...' After naming the three children, Olney continues:

Knowledge of their country is now being passed on to this group by very knowledgeable non-claimants such as their mother's mother, Maudie Bennett ... In the Kenbi situation it would actually be quite surprising if the knowledge transfer was taking place within the Larrakia group given that the Larrakia have been dislocated from the Kenbi area and there has been a significant presence of non-Larrakia for around 100 years.

Brandl et al (1979:172) emphasise that much of their information comes from people outside the *danggalaba* clan, like George Munggalu and others. Brandl and Walsh (1983:151) found themselves 'working with people of at least seven other language affiliations' while preparing a claim to Dum-in-mirrie Island off the Cox Peninsula near Darwin. The anthropologists comment: 'It quickly became clear to us that the island being claimed could not be limited to neither to the label Larrakia nor to the area of land bordered by sea and reefs' (Brandl and Walsh 1983:149).

Primary spiritual responsibility

Brandl and Walsh (1983:149) also give the example of George Munggalu. They write:

When a person, say George Munggalu, is asked how he identifies himself, he will look first at the questioner and attribute motives, and then at the circumstances of the question. He then seeks to select those facets of his identity that correspond to these factors.

The paragraph relating how George Munggalu is identified is similar to the description in the Kenbi Claim Book (Brandl et al 1979:34) with a few additions:

George is a man about 60 years of age. He was born in Darwin, his 'country' is Banagaya south of the Daly River; his principal clan affiliation is *durlg*, or sea-monster or whale or rainbow. His mother's language was Djeridj, his father's Wadjiginy. He was initiated at Bilurrigwa east of Darwin by men of the *danggalaba* clan of the Larrakia linguistic group, and he is often said to be Larrakia. During the Second World War he served in the Black Watch of the Australian Army, which guarded our northern coast, and has lived now for many years with his friend Roy Edwards, a pastoralist, at Newcastle Waters, many hundreds of kilometres from the Darwin area. He was described to us by many as the person most knowledgeable about the island's area (Brandl and Walsh 1983:149).

Munggalu evidently continued his ceremonial duties into later years. Discussing Old Man Rock, Walsh (1989a:11) notes:

Richard Barnes has taken a very active interest in the protection of Larrakia sites in the Darwin area and in January 1985 he contacted the Aboriginal Sacred Sites Authority at least twice because of the possibility of burning off in the Casuarina beach area. George Munggalu had been particularly concerned about burning off in this area since there had apparently been a traditional ban on this activity.

Under the heading, 'Primary spiritual responsibility' in regard to Kenbi, Walsh (1989a:29) claims that 'primary spiritual responsibility is a corporate issue' in Larrakia territory. That is 'overall spiritual responsibility is held by the totality of Larrakia' (p.29). However, Walsh (1989a:29) adds:

... as people become older, some, according to their personal ability, will come to exercise primary spiritual responsibility publicly. The late George Munggalu and the late Roy Yarrowen both had personal charisma combined with a deep knowledge of country and ceremony which propelled them into major roles in the public exercise of spiritual responsibility'.

Justice Olney (1991:50) commented:

In my view the expansion of the [Larrakia] claim to include various Wagaitj groups was an expedient adapted in an endeavour to boost the claim at a time when the evidence taken thus far to support Larrakia claim appeared to have fallen short of what was required to establish traditional Aboriginal ownership.²⁴

Delfin Cubillo, Richard Barnes and the missing tape recordings

Inez Carter-Cubillo (1996:12) writes of her father Delfin Cubillo:

Dad also saw it as his place to teach and introduce the Cubillo family into their Larrakia lineage and for them to be proud of where their roots lay. Dad witnessed the way that some Larrakia people suffered a great loss of life through the mixing of bloods and through the growth of Darwin, its different legislation and 'European Colonisation'. Dad also saw the need to introduce another member of his family, a nephew Richard Barnes, to the late George Munggaloo (Senior Larrakia ceremony men) and the late Bobby Secretary and Sister, the late Topsy Secretary (Larrakia Elders) to make sure another member of his family had a connection, as my father at that time was the Patriarch of the Cubillo family.²⁵

Cubillo-Carter's first hand account of how Richard Barnes became the 'keeper' of George Munggalu's stories makes interesting reading. Inez Cubillo-Carter (2000:142-3) relates the story in some detail:

Dad would ask Roy Edwards if it was okay to bring old George home to our place for the day in Aralia Street Nightcliff. It was important, because dad wanted to talk about Larrakia customs and law, as he knew how important it was to have this knowledge. It was through this experience that Dad saw the need to introduce another member of the family, a nephew, Richard Barnes in 1984, to the late George Munggaloo (Senior Larrakia Ceremony Man) and (Larrakia Elders) the late Bobby Secretary, and sister, the late Topsy, to make sure another member of his family had a connection.

It was during these meetings and teachings at our house that Richard was given the task of recording (Dad did not have a working tape recorder at the time) that the history of Larrakia culture, tradition and ownership (Kenbi Land Claim) was being recorded by George before he passed away [in] 1985. Richard was supposed to record and not to keep the stories.

Unfortunately, your dad died before he was given the tapes but the family still expected Richard to give us our tapes or even a copy. Until this day we have not received it. After all the main connection to the Larrakia Elders, George Mungaloo and Bobby Secretary, was my dad, and not the young man that they had just recently met. They trusted dad with the stories and it was important that he have the knowledge that was taped in our family home.

Mum remembers the men making the recordings as she was often told to leave the room as they were recording 'Men's Business'.

When George Mungaloo died, Roy Edwards flew his body back to Belyuen to be buried in his homeland at Belyuen. His sister Victoria was also buried at Belyuen.²⁶

'Bestowal' of the names Belyuen and Koolpinya, Casuarina Beach, 1984

Cubillo-Carter (2000:143-4) includes two photographs of George Munggalu with members of the Cubillo family. Firstly, 'George Mungaloo bestows the name 'Belyuen' to Delfin Cubillo to tie him into the land across the harbour'. The photograph was taken at Delfin's Nightcliff home on Thursday 8th September 1984. Secondly, a photograph of Delfin, George and Richard Barnes with the caption: 'Earlier they were at Casuarina beach where George Mungaloo bestowed the name "Koolpinyah" on Richard, 8th September 1984'. Another photograph (Cubillo-Carter 2000:144) shows Delfin's son Mario with 'George Mungaloo's son, the late Johnnie Bianamu'.²⁷ Mansfield (2006:178) also comments: 'In the current proceedings (but not, it should be noted, in the Kenbi Claim proceedings), Richard Barnes said that he had been "given" the frog dreaming by George Munggalu when the latter gave him the name 'Koolpinyah'.

As further evidence, Cubillo-Carter's family history includes a full page photocopy of an entire letter from David Ritchie, Chief Executive Officer of the Aboriginal Areas Protection Authority, dated 23 November, 1994. In this letter to 'Mrs Ines Cubillo-Carter', Ritchie writes that he has discussed the naming of Delfin with Field Officer David Cooper 'who recalls a meeting with the late George Mungaloo, your father and Richard Barnes on Casuarina Beach on 8th September 1984' (Cubillo-Carter 2000:139). The letter continues:

At this meeting George Mungaloo related stories about Nungalinya, Old Man Rock and spoke at length to Richard and Dolphin [sic] about Larrakia customs and traditions. Much of the conversation took place out of the earshot of David Cooper who understood they were discussing matters that were restricted according to Larrakia tradition. It is the Authority's understanding that this was the occasion that George Mungaloo bestowed the name Belyuen on Dolphin Cubillo. The name Belyuen, of which you are aware, refers to a site on the Kenbi dreaming track. Unfortunately there were no sound tapes made during the course of these meetings.

The question arises as to the significance of 'the bestowal' of the names, 'Belyuen' and 'Koolpinya'. The court transcripts reveal that the water hole, spring or more correctly, dam, named Belyuen where the community of the same name is situated is a significant site. In addition, Lockwood (1960:74) describes an experience at 'Blue Lagoon' on Koolpinya Station, quoting an informant who said: 'Yes it has always been a native Dreaming. They won't swim or spear fish there. In fact they don't even like going near it.'²⁸ However, while being given a name of a site is an honour, it is not an unusual way to show friendship without giving any authority that would be recognised by everyone associated with the site. For example, in about 1978

Bobby Secretary gave my four year old son the name 'Belyuen' and my six-year-old daughter the name 'Kulaluk'. Neither of them have ever claimed to have any special position in Larrakia culture, and would unlikely to be recognised if they did. I would suggest that the 'bestowal' of the name of a site is no different to the common granting of a skin category.

Under the heading 'Naming', Walsh (1989:20) states: 'The practice of *ngirawad* or bestowal of personal names is another Larrakia tradition that links people with country. The name can be a place name and can also be shared with another person, and is usually bestowed in a formal ceremonial setting.' Brandl et al (1979:38-40) expand on this custom:

Ngirawad, like *manaidj* [godparent] and *merbok* (Stanner 1933-4:156), a complex system of 'intertribal' exchange, served to link people with people, and people with land, and land with land, over a wide area. Like kinship links and alliances forged through marriage (Tonkinson 1978:8), these were devices which expanded the social field of individuals and of groups, particularly with regard to territorial and socio-religious affiliations.

Similarly, Brandl and Walsh (1983:153) explain that the custom of bestowing names is used to link Larrakia people to 'people to the east, west and the south':

Ngirawad can be roughly translated as 'namesake'. A person in the claim area can have a name from another person or from a place, and places can be namesakes for one another, too. This exchange of names, a formal affair, is one of the activities that cuts across people in the social field and links them with people to the east, west and the south.

Shortly after arriving in Darwin in 1969, as a 'hippy' living on Lameroo Beach, the author of this essay was given the name of a sacred site in the Roper River by newfound friends from the community of Ngukurr. The evidence therefore suggests that the bestowing of names is common across language groups to forge alliances without detracting from the land owners' inherited rights and interests.

'A Call Out For All Larrakia' 1971-73.

Although Richard Barnes says in evidence that he 'did not know about anything that was happening in regard to Larrakia land claims, the claim for Kulaluk and other Larrakia areas received a huge amount of publicity from 1971 to when the Interim Aboriginal Land Commissioner, Judge Dick Ward began his hearings in 1975. On May 29th, 1971, an article was printed in the *NT News* headed, 'A Call Out For All Larrakias' informing the public that 'All members of the almost extinct tribe of the Darwin area are being called together'. The article continued: 'Tribal leader, Mr Kooloomurinyee (known everywhere as Mr Bobby Secretary) said yesterday that this was necessary after his talks yesterday with the assistant-administrator (Welfare) Mr Harry Giese... [Bobby Secretary] hoped to get all Larrakias together within a week or so'. Bobby Secretary's group and others camped around Darwin also publicised their cause from 1971-1984 in a newsletter, *Bunji*, which was widely circulated around Darwin and beyond. Later the story of the Larrakia struggle was told by Bill Day in his book, *Bunji: a story of the Gwalwa Daraniki Movement* (Day 1994).

Despite the widely publicised campaign, including raising a flag to claim Darwin (Day 1994, 2008), four sit downs across Bagot Road between 1971 and 1972, a firebombing at Kulaluk and a protest camp on Quail Island (Duwun) in 1973 and the public hearings of the Kulaluk, Gundal and Old Man Rock claims in 1975, Richard Barnes maintained during his cross questioning in the Kenbi Claim that ‘before the land rights came into being there was not really much that Aboriginal people could do to acquire land or look after land or anything like that. It just was not much said about it. There did not seem to be any process for doing it’ (Avery 1997:136)

A further appeal for Larrakia support was made in 1973. Before the visit of the Aboriginal Land Rights Commissioner, Mr Justice Woodward, to Kulaluk on June 2 1973 a call for all Larrakia to attend the planned combined meeting was placed in the public notices of the *NT News*. The notice stated:

All Larrakia tribe descendants who may be eligible for land rights – you are invited to meet Judge Woodward at Kulaluk 10a.m. 2nd June’.

At the Kulaluk meeting with Commissioner Woodward in 1973 the names of known Larrakia people were displayed on the wall of a hut at the camp as they had been since the previous year;²⁹ however, after meeting with the elders, Tommy Lyons, Bobby Secretary and Captain Bishop, Woodward requested a Larrakia genealogy, if one was available.³⁰ As a result, Bill Day wrote to Justice Woodward on July 1, 1973 enclosing a genealogical diagram made with the assistance of Topsy Secretary who was then living at Kulaluk.³¹ The letter quoted the newspaper public notice (above) and commented: ‘No one came in response to this add [sic]. In the light of this family tree it seems there are far more Larrakias than I realised’.³² A note on the genealogical chart states: ‘Selma says: ‘When Woolner, Minija and Larrakia tribes were almost gone, Fred Waters (an elder, dec.) said we would be together. This is emphasised – Woolner, Minja, Larrakia – one people.’

Although the genealogy made with Topsy Secretary was inclusive of many Aboriginal people from the ‘Woolner and Minija side’ who would not be classed as Larrakia for the purposes of native title, neither Annie, her son Jack or daughter Lily appear. Nor do any of their descendants in the Cubillo and Odegaard families.³³ Likewise George Munggalu does not appear on the definitive Topsy Secretary genealogy transcribed by Bill Day which was made before the politicisation of the Larrakia claims and as far as is known, never submitted as evidence to subsequent inquiries or Larrakia land claim hearings.

Despite the earlier non-appearance at Kulaluk, Cubillo-Carter (2000:138) records that ‘Mr and Mrs Delfin Cubillo’ received an official invitation to ‘the handing over of the Kulaluk Land Title ... to take place on Saturday 25th August 1979 at 1.30 p.m.’.³⁴ A photograph reproduced in the book shows Delfin Cubillo, Bobby Secretary, Teresa Cubillo and Topsy Secretary at the hand over ceremony (Carter-Cubillo 2000:138).

One of Richard Barnes’s first appearances in the media came after the announcement of Tibby Quall’s so-called Larrakia land claim over Darwin two days before the NT election in June 1994. The much publicised announcement was made at the Nightcliff Hotel attended by NT Aboriginal Development Minister Steve

Hatton. It was regarded by many as the nail in the coffin for the Labor Party's election chances. Immediately following the election, NLC Director Darryl Pearce and Richard Barnes attended a pre-organised meeting at Kulaluk where the Larrakia were at pains to distance themselves from Tibby's claim. A report on the claim and the subsequent meeting later appeared in *Land Rights News* (August 1994, page 5):

At the meeting an angry senior Larrakia said that 'all Darwinians must live together and love one another', and wanted to reassure all that no one was in danger of losing any land or houses, both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal.

'What the Larrakia want however, is for the NLC to look at what interests the Larrakia have in land in the Darwin area, and for those interests to be recognised,' [said Mr Pearce following the meeting].

'This includes the proposed Palmerston suburb of Rosebury [sic]. The NT Government have advertised for any interest in land for the Rosebury area to be expressed. The Larrakia want that potential interest in land to be expressed,' said Mr Pearce.

A photograph accompanying the article is captioned: 'Larrakia spokesperson Richard Barnes, right, speaks with NLC Director Darryl Pearce at a meeting with the Larrakia at Kulaluk in June.'³⁵ However, by the end of 1994 the Larrakia Nation in conjunction with the Northern Land Council had lodged another native title claim over areas in Palmerston, followed by the 1996 native title claim over the Darwin area.

The Larrakia 'new tribe'

The anthropologist Peter Sutton (1998:104-113) describes the Larrakia as one of the many emergent 'new tribes' in Australia. In 1989 Michael Walsh described a period of renewed interest in Larrakia claims. Walsh (1989a:25) wrote:

The active involvement in, and understanding of, the land claim process on the part of Darwin-based people of Larrakia descent has grown significantly from the early 1980s. Among the most active have been members of the Fejo family, the Roman family, the Cubillo family (including Richard Barnes), the May family, the Quall family and the Raymond family. By 1983 the Larrakia Association had been formed. This association, open to people of Larrakia descent, includes land rights issues among its aims but has provided a focus for any issues affecting Larrakia people. Around the same time (August 1983) a group of urban Larrakia wrote to the Northern Land Council seeking to be added to the list of claimants.

In the 1980s, legal precedents set out in the Jawoyn (Kearney 1988), Finnis River (Toohey 1981), Daly River (Toohey 1982) and Nicholson River (Kearney 1984) land claims gave renewed hope to urbanised Aboriginal people. In his discussion of the phenomenon, Sutton (1998:106) argued that incorporated bodies like the Larrakia Association should be seen as part of the 'new tribes' movement:

Many of the new tribes of Australia have become legally incorporated. These are partly exercises in attempted fixity. The Larrakia Association is just such a formal body. It is evidence that members if the wider group of Larrakia people can, as far as practicable, act as a formal body with respect to the tribe's landed interests. Contested definitions of who is Larrakia are not solely the province of

informal day-to-day cultural and social life, but may also have a formal manifestation from time to time.

One of the sources of conflict in such organisations is debate over membership and membership criteria. The current membership criterion of the Larrakia Association is that one must be Larrakia. There have been some conflicts within the organisation that have been followed by certain people forming their own small associations. There have been debates in the organisation over the acceptability of claims of certain people to Larrakia identity (Sutton 1998:106).

In 2000 Richard Barnes registered a new representative body, the Larrakia Aboriginal Corporation (LAC); however, by 2009 the web site of the Office of the Registrar of Indigenous Corporations listed the LAC for deregistration.³⁶ Meanwhile, the Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation, registered on 25th May, 1998, survives as the main representative body for Larrakia people with an administration complex at 76 Dickward Drive, Coconut Grove, 0810.³⁷ However, as this essay illustrates, disputes over the ‘formal manifestation’ of the right to speak for the Larrakia people have continued to follow Richard Barnes.

The Larrakia Development Corporation

The Northern Land Council is presently the sole shareholder of the Larrakia Development Corporation under a trust deed on behalf of the Larrakia People. The trust, dated 8 February 2002, provides that the sole share may only be transferred at the direction of the Larrakia to a body corporate established after a finding by a Court that the Larrakia are the native title holders of land in the Darwin region and which resolves any internal dispute as to the composition of the Larrakia group (Fry 2007).³⁸ As the representative organisation established by and for the Larrakia people, the Larrakia Nation claim that it was to become the Prescribed Body Corporate under Native Title regulations ‘pursuant to Section 56(2) or a determination pursuant to section 57(2) of the Native Title Act 1993 (LNAC 2007). However, following the failure of the Larrakia native title claim the NLC has refused to transfer the control of the Larrakia Development Corporation to the Larrakia Nation, claiming the Nation does not possess the ‘significant commercial expertise required to perform the critical shareholding function’.³⁹

French et al (2007) cite Mansfield’s judgement that the Larrakia people do not have native title over the Darwin area (Area A). Mansfield said:

I have therefore reached the conclusion that the Larrakia people that is the present society comprising the Larrakia people, do not now have rights and interests possessed under the traditional laws acknowledged, and the traditional customs observed, by the Larrakia people at sovereignty. That is because I do not find that their current laws and customs are ‘traditional’ in the sense explained in *Yorta Yorta*.

Before the Mansfield judgement, in the year 2000, Aboriginal Land Commissioner Justice Gray eventually found in favour of the Kenbi Land Claim on Cox Peninsula across the harbour made under the *Land Rights Act, 1976*. He ruled that six traditional owners survived but noted that 1,600 claimants would benefit. In answer to NT Government fears that planning and development were threatened by the decision, Chief

Executive Officer of the NLC Norman Fry said. ‘Aboriginal people in the Territory are just as keen to see Darwin and the NT grow and progress as any other Territorian. Larrakia spokesperson Mr Bill Risk agreed. In *Land Rights News* (March 2001, page 11) Billy Risk is quoted as saying:

There is no threat to development from the confirmation of our land rights. Larrakia people have always made it very clear that we are not anti-development on our land, provided our rights are recognised and protected. We have already shown we can negotiate win-win outcomes in our agreement over LNG plant at Wickham Point.

However, it wasn’t until January 2009 that an ‘in principle agreement’ was reached between the Northern Territory Government, the NLC, and the Tommy Lyons group. The deal came almost eight years after the NT Government’s decision to withdraw from the long running legal battle waged by the previous CLP government and settle the matter through negotiation. The LDC chief executive, Greg Constantine said he hoped for a prompt approval of the January 2009 settlement from the federal government.⁴⁰ According to the website of the Larrakia Development Corporation:

The Kenbi Claim affects over 600 square kilometres of Cox Peninsula. The ‘in principle agreement’ reached between the government and Northern Land Council has assigned 15,000 hectares of this land as Territory Freehold to be managed by the Larrakia Development Corporation for commercial development. The remaining 52,000 hectares will become communally held Aboriginal Land, managed similarly to Arnhem Land.⁴¹

The Board of the Larrakia Development Corporation is now looking forward to fine-tuning plans to develop employment and commercial opportunities to benefit all Larrakia and other Aboriginal people on the Cox Peninsula pending the final stage of the Kenbi claim process... Chairman Koolpinyah Barnes said the project and financial experience gained by the corporation will be further utilised when Kenbi is finalised.

‘The Board looks forward to continuing to work for all Larrakia on new commercial opportunities on Cox Peninsula as well as continuing and growing our Darwin projects,’ Mr Barnes said.

Amongst other projects over the past seven years, Larrakia Development Corporation has developed the multi-million dollar Darla subdivision at Palmerston, established the award-winning Larrakia Homes company and the steel company, Saltwater Construction. In July 2009, the *NT News* printed a statement by ‘Corporation Chairman Koolpinya Barnes’ announcing that a trade training school for will be started on land owned by the corporation near the Darwin Port Precinct at Berrimah.⁴² Also in July, Koolpinya Barnes announced that distributions to senior Larrakia people would be increased from ‘\$200 per quarter to \$250 per quarter, or \$1,000 per year’.⁴³

The origins of the LDC have been explained by Peter Murphy (2009):

The Northern Land Council, a statutory authority of the Commonwealth government, is not a business organisation. But its members saw the need for an Aboriginal grouping to turn land rights and subsequent Native Title laws into business and job opportunities for Aboriginal people...

The late Les Toy, a developer whose family still holds the L J Hooker franchise in Darwin, and Norman Fry, the then manager of the Northern Land Council, worked the idea through with Larrakia people like Bill Risk, Laurie Cubillo, Koolpinyah Barnes and Kelvin Costello....

Norman Fry allocated \$10,000 'seed' money from NLC funds to get the newly-formed Larrakia Development Corporation registered and on its financial feet. The rest is history...

Another side of the story is told by the Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation (LNAC) in a 2008 media release (Jackson 2008) which claims:

The LDC as a corporate entity, and its Chair Richard Barnes, have no absolutely no cultural nor legal authority, to make decisions on the use of Larrakia land, outside of its original terms of reference to develop Roseberry and Darla in Palmerston.

When the Larrakia Nation enquired about the handing over of the sole share of the LDC to the 'peak representative body' for the Larrakia People (i.e. the Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation), the NLC responded in 'insulting legal terms, essentially informing [the LNAC] that NLC will choose the recipient of the share, stating they favour the LDC' (Jackson 2008). In fact, the NLC (Fry 2007) stated:

The Larrakia Nation, by its rules and through its practice, performs important community and cultural functions, but could not be said to possess the significant commercial expertise required to perform the critical shareholding function. The NLC further understands that there is little support within the Larrakia group, and its constituent families, for the proposition that the Larrakia Nation perform this function. In these circumstances the NLC is not prepared to accede to your suggestion that the shareholding be transferred to the Larrakia Nation.

The LDC and the LNAC previously clashed over plans to develop Middle Arm in Darwin Harbour. In a full-page advertisement signed by CEO Greg Constantine, the Chairman of the Larrakia Development Corporation 'Koolpinyah Richard Barnes' praised the decision by a Japanese gas company, Inpex, to consider Middle Arm as a potential site for their \$12 billion liquefied natural gas plant. In the ad, Barnes said:

The Larrakia Development Corporation has already expressed interest to formalise an MOU agreement with Inpex as we have in the past with Bechel, Waterfront Corporation, Sitzlers and others. This is a two way street, we supply Inpex with on-the-ground support, labour and the backing of the majority of Larrakia people, and they provide genuine business and employment opportunities for them. Our discussions with Inpex was on the understanding that the company was continuing with its environmental impact study of the area and will isolate any archaeological sites such as middens and artefacts that may be found there.

Our track record in fostering this kind of partnership has built us a positive reputation in assisting proponents of major projects. It's been a win-win for both sides, particularly for the Larrakia – we have placed over 150 Larrakia and other Aboriginal people in jobs over the past three years... (Constantine 2008).⁴⁴

The Larrakia Nation's acting chairwoman, Donna Jackson, responded in strong language, pointing out that the Larrakia Development Corporation has no authority over Aboriginal land at Middle Arm. Ms Jackson said:

The LDC is a corporate entity. It and its chair Richard Barnes have absolutely no cultural or legal authority to make decisions on the use of Larrakia land, outside of its original terms of reference.⁴⁵

In an 'Open Letter to Darwin' (*NT News*, September 27, 2008) the Larrakia Nation informed the public that Larrakia Nation does not support the Inpex development. The statement continued:

We have repeatedly informed Government and the Northern Land Council of this. The Larrakia Development Corporation (LDC) is not representative of the Larrakia people. Their board of directors is appointed by the Northern Land Council, which holds the shares of this corporate entity. The LDC does not consult us and is not accountable to us. We do not know any details about deals done between the LDC, Inpex and the NT Government in the name of Larrakia.

The Larrakia people have repeatedly stated that we place major and utmost importance on the preservation of our ancestral land and sea country. We do not believe that the Inpex gas development is compatible with our ideals, beliefs and our culture.⁴⁶

Donna Jackson has also made it clear in public statements that the Larrakia nation opposes the full scale industrialisation of Middle Arm, including the Inpex LNG plant, the Arafura Resources proposal for a uranium processing plant and the Dow Chemicals plant.⁴⁷ Donna Jackson added:

The Larrakia Nation agreed to the formation of the Development Corporation (as advertised by the NLC) under the provision that LDC would sit under Larrakia Nation, and seek full consultation, consent and guidance from Larrakia Nation on all issues relating to our land and culture.⁴⁸

Obviously, from the above comments when Judge Mansfield ruled that native title had been extinguished in Darwin, the Larrakia Nation lost much of its purpose for being, while the Larrakia Development Corporation and its chairperson, Richard Barnes, has manoeuvred to usurp the functions of the Larrakia Nation with the support of the NLC, Big Business and the NT Government. As LDC CEO Greg Constantine (2008) has said:

The Larrakia Development Corporation has grown from strength to strength and while disappointed on the one hand, acknowledges on the other the dismissal of Native Title on Darwin land has removed uncertainties and strengthened confidence for industry to do business in town. It sees the development of Middle Arm as a positive step forward in building a better future for Darwin and its traditional landowners, the Larrakia.

Donna Jackson represents a different view point. In 2009 Donna was working for the Top End Aboriginal Conservation Alliance (TEACA) from an office in the Rapid Creek Shopping Centre. She told Graham Ring from the *National Indigenous Times* (Ring 2008:28) that she was not blindly anti-development. However, she is concerned about the mushrooming of 'Aboriginal development corporations' designed to facilitate development on Aboriginal land. Donna emphasised:

Over time these [corporations] can become more powerful than the people that they supposedly represent. Aboriginal people who worry for country need to keep a close eye on these corporations and make them fully accountable to the people. We are the sovereigns of our country and we should never forget that, nor let others forget.

However, the *Northern Territory News* has revealed its bias in a report on ‘one of the most important announcements in Australia’s history’ (Adlam 2008).⁴⁹ The report on the Inpex deal was accompanied by a photograph of the painted Kenbi Dancers dancing in loin cloths for the seated Federal Minister for Resources and Energy, Martin Ferguson, Inpex president, Naoki Kuroda, Chief Minister Paul Henderson and ‘Larrakia Elder Koolpinyah Barnes’ ‘as the \$12 billion Inpex plant was announced...’ Adlam’s article continued:

The only sour note in the day was the abuse hurled at people leaving the press conference by the Larrakia Nation’s Donna Jackson.

The Nation’s bitter enemy, the Larrakia Development Corporation, an Aboriginal run commercial enterprise that puts indigenous workers in jobs, wholeheartedly supports the gas plant.

Its members weren’t out in the hot sun – they were in the air-conditioning inside buttering up Inpex executives for future Aboriginal job opportunities.

By 2010, things had changed at the LDC. On 6th October, 2010, *The Northern Territory News* reported, ‘Larrakia chair hangs up his boots’. The article continued:

One of the Northern Territory’s most influential indigenous leaders retired yesterday. Koolpinyah Barnes stepped down as chairman of the Larrakia Development Corporation after seven years. Under his leadership, the corporation grew from a small construction company to a major developer. It has many job-creation deals with big enterprises, including Inpex, and is building a trade training centre in Darwin. The corporation established its credibility through the five-stage Darla housing subdivision at Palmerston. It later branched out into repairs and maintenance, landscaping and a bus service.

Mr Barnes, one of the few surviving Larrakia speakers, said that the corporation should never forget its ‘cultural roots’. The organisation spent \$500,000 of its profits on Larrakia people, increasing to \$1 million this financial year. Barrister and father of five, Nigel Browne, 32, has taken over the chair.

The resignation of Barnes was followed by the departure of CEO, Greg Constantine, who resigned in June, 2011. Under the heading ‘Larrakia chief steps down’, the *NT News* reported on 7th June, 2011:

Greg Constantine resigned as chief executive of the Larrakia Development Corporation yesterday. He will leave in August after holding the job for a total of nine years. Mr Constantine, who has been a regular fixture on the *NT News’ 150 Most Powerful List* each year, was instrumental in the corporation’s commercial success, including the Darla housing subdivision in Darwin, the building of the \$4.5 million Larrakia Trade Training Centre, the Lyons housing estate and the jobs agreement with Inpex. He said it was time to step down.

‘I believe now is the right time to bring new blood to lead the Larrakia Development Corporation into its next phase,’ he said.

Conclusion

Those who were involved in the Larrakia struggle from 1971 might question Richard Barnes’ belief that ‘there was no means of getting the country back until something like the Land Rights Act came into being’

and that he did not think there was ‘anything going on’ because he ‘did not know about anything that was happening’. Anyone of Richard’s age living in Darwin or even interstate must have been aware of the Larrakia protests and demonstrations occurring in Darwin in the 1970s. Perhaps it was only after his 1984 ‘bestowal’ by George Munggalu that Richard felt wholly Larrakia.

As stated in this essay, neither George Munggalu nor the Odegaard and Cubillo families appeared in genealogies prepared by Larrakia elders in 1973. Indeed George Munggalu never professed to be Larrakia. If he had lived longer he would have undoubtedly participated in his own land claim, as did another charismatic elder, Felix Holmes, who was on a ceremonial level with George Munggalu, although also not a Larrakia.⁵⁰ George Munggalu lived in Newcastle Waters and only came to the fore after being recruited by representatives of the Northern Land Council to strengthen the Gundal claim that became a forerunner to the Kenbi Claim. Even so, he was used to gain agreement to build Parliament House on Emery Point against the wishes of other Larrakia people and their supporters in 1975. I doubt if his name is mentioned in any of the sixty-four editions of the newsletter, *Bunji* that publicised the Larrakia cause from 1971 to 1985 (Day 1993).

Brandl and Walsh (1983:149) describe George Munggalu as selectively choosing ‘the facets of his identity’ according to the motives and circumstances of the questioner. No doubt this method of thinking came from many years of working as a ‘factotum’⁵¹ for a white station-owner boss who Egan describes as ‘a rich old turd’. Perhaps in seeking to please, George Munggalu ‘bestowed’ names on Delfin Cubillo and Richard Barnes, but there are no particular rights that are ‘bestowed’ with the sharing of names, particularly from a non-Larrakia - more likely the names signify an obligation under a system of exchange that traditionally is used to strengthen links between Aboriginal people. As Barnes himself points out, Koolpinya was the name of the butcher shop owned by Munggalu’s ‘boss’, Roy Edwards, and he has not disclosed any alternative meaning.

At a later stage, after the Larrakia had received recognition at Kulaluk, Delfin Cubillo recorded information from George Munggalu on an old tape recorder the year before both men died.⁵² Inez Cubillo-Carter writes that these tapes were taken by Richard Barnes and never returned, although the motivation for the recording appears to have been Delfin’s interest in Larrakia culture. Cubillo-Carter implies that Richard Barnes wrongfully gained the Munggalu tapes from Delfin Cubillo for his own purposes. Furthermore, there is the suspicion that the tapes contain knowledge that Munggalu was not entitled to pass on to an uninitiated man and that he may have done so under pressure to please a relative. As Cubillo-Carter plaintively writes about the lost tapes

:

After all the main connection to the Larrakia Elders, George Mungaloo and Bobby Secretary, was my dad, and not the young man [Richard Barnes] that they had just recently met. They trusted dad with the stories and it was important that he have the knowledge that was taped in our family home.

Contradicting the 1984 succession story by Richard Barnes is the public statement recorded on Cox Peninsula on 1st August, 1979 by the NLC anthropologists that George Munggalu passed his authority to the descendants of Tommy Lyons, saying, 'They are the bosses now. Anybody who wants to see, ask them.' (Brandl et al 1979:171). Also Munggalu is recorded as acknowledging Bobby Secretary as 'the big boss of Darwin' so it is doubtful that he would have over-ruled that authority while Bobby Secretary was alive.⁵³

Finally, after analysing more evidence than can be presented in this essay, Judge Mansfield found that 'it is clear that the relationship [between Richard Barnes and George Munggalu] was of narrow scope even in relation to Aboriginal matters'. The alleged document referred to by Richard Barnes at the opening of Parliament, 'signed by senior Larrakia people saying that I can speak on behalf of the Larrakia, and speak on matters of law in relation to Larrakia' would surely be a worthless piece of paper under customary law. As Walsh (1989a:29) claims, 'primary spiritual responsibility is a corporate issue' in Larrakia territory. That is - 'overall spiritual responsibility is held by the *totality* of Larrakia'

There remains the question of 'Minnie' and 'Maggie', the two women who are recorded as being the bearers of George McKeddie's son and daughter. The court appeared unconvinced that these women were one and the same as 'Annie'. In addition the court was expected to rely on hearsay evidence of a supposedly inherited defect of the right eye that showed a resemblance to a 1878 photograph of a woman identified as 'Minnie' who resembled 'Lily' and therefore might be 'Annie'. In addition, Avery (1997) reports that 'Richard Barnes said neither Delphin Cubillo [sic] nor George Munggulu knew the name of Annie Duwun'. In the column for 'Tribe', neither 'Minnie' nor 'Maggie' is recorded as being Larrakia, unlike other mothers on the same 'List of Half Casts' [sic]. Instead, the mothers of Lily and Jack are identified under 'Tribe' as 'South port', which leaves room for more doubt as to the maternal ancestry of the McKeddie siblings.

Now that Richard Barnes has become Chairman of the Larrakia Development Corporation, his claim to have authority to speak for Larrakia people has become politicised. The acceptance of his claims by the media has created the public perception that Larrakia people acknowledge Richard Barnes's stated position. This is not so, and in mid 2009 Richard Barnes threatened to take legal action against the Larrakia Nation for publicly refuting his claims to have had traditional authority passed on to him by George Munggalu. His action is not surprising because Richard Barnes has used his persona of Larrakia lawman to project an image that appears to have given him some standing in business and community affairs. For example, he was invited to present the welcome speech in Parliament in 2009.

As stated in the introduction, it is not the intention of this essay to detract from the dedicated work of Richard Barnes for the Larrakia People that he regards as his own or to decry his artistic talents. However, the most generous assessment of the motives for the actions of Richard Barnes is that he embarked on a genuine, if misguided search for his Aboriginal identity following an awakening after Larrakia land rights became a reality. Even so, that awakening was inspired in the first place by his uncle, Delfin Cubillo, and the

possession of the tape recordings Delfin made with George Munggalu. Prior to the mid-1980s Barnes appears to have been unaware of the struggle for Aboriginal land rights, although he was born around the same year as supporters who worked with Bobby Secretary and members of the Gwalwa Daraniki Movement for land rights in Darwin in the turbulent 1970s.

With others, Richard Barnes was instrumental in forming the Larrakia Aboriginal Corporation and the Larrakia Development Corporation. However, he was never involved in the Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation. During this time the ritual of a 'Larrakia Welcome to Country' has become standard practise at public events. Though symbolic, this gesture alone is a huge shift from the days when the unrecognised remnants of the Larrakia tribe lived in sufferance in humpies on vacant crown land. As a man between two worlds, Richard Barnes has found acceptance among business people and the media who view him as a reasonable man with the right credentials who is willing to negotiate. However, Barnes is yet to prove that he can carry the Larrakia people with him in the wheeling and dealing of the Darwin development market.

In conclusion, this essay makes no final judgement about the credentials professed by Richard Barnes. This essay lets the facts speak for themselves. As the courts have noted, many details in the Cubillo story relating their descent from a relationship between George McKeddie and Annie appear to have been of fairly recent origin, followed by their even more recent cementing of ties, first with Bobby Secretary and then with George Munggalu. The secret nature of whispered confidences witnessed by David Cooper at Casuarina Beach does not have the authority of the documented statement of succession made by George Munggalu and witnessed during field work on Cox Peninsula in 1979. As Richard Barnes's supposed 'anointing' as one with authority to speak for all Larrakia becomes increasingly convergent with commercial dealings, supported by his position in the Larrakia Development Corporation, Donna Jackson's warning that Aboriginal corporations can become more powerful than the people that they are supposed to represent begins to ring true.

References:

- Adlam, Nigel 2008 'Meek inherit the earth – big news came softly'. *NT News* July 27, 2008.
- Avery, J 1997 *Consultant anthropologist's Report to the Aboriginal Land Commissioner*. Darwin: Aboriginal Land Commission.
- Brandl, Maria 1983 *Aboriginal groups of the Darwin area, focussing on Darwin town*. Darwin: Aboriginal Sacred Sites Authority.
- Brandl, M, A Haritos and M Walsh 1979 *Kenbi land claim to vacant Crown land in the Cox Peninsula, Bynoe Harbour and Port Patterson areas of the Northern Territory of Australia*. Darwin: Northern Land Council.
- Brandl, M and M Walsh 1983 Roots and branches, or the far-flung net of Aboriginal relationships. In *Aborigines, land and land rights*. N Peterson and M Langton, eds. Pp.149-159. Canberra: Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies.
- Buchanan, Cheryl 1974 *We have bugger all: the Kulaluk Story*. Melbourne: Australian Union of Students.
- Constantine, Greg 2008 'No middle ground for Middle Arm Development.', *NT News*, June 5, 2008, p. 4.
- Cubillo-Carter, Inez 2000 *Keeper of the stories, Delfin Antonio Cubillo: The history of the Cubillo family, 1788-1996*. Darwin: Cubillo-Carter Enterprises.
- Davis, S 1994 'Felix Holmes' In *Above Capricorn: Aboriginal Biographies from Northern Australia*. Pp. 34-41. Sydney: Angus and Robertson.
- Day, William Bartlett (ed) 1993 *The complete 64 editions of Bunji, newsletter of the Gwalwa Daraniki Movement, 1971-1983*. Photocopied bound volume
- Day, Bill 1994 *Bunji: a story of the Gwalwa Daraniki Movement*. Canberra: Aboriginal Studies Press.
- Day, W B 1996 *Stand strong together: Fighting for Land Rights in Darwin*. Videorecording.
- Day, William Bartlett 2001 *Fringe Dwellers in Darwin: Cultural persistence or a culture of resistance?* PhD Thesis, Department of Anthropology, The University of Western Australia.
- Egan, Ted 1997 *Sitdown Up North: an autobiography*. Maverickville: Kerr Publishing.
- French, Finn and Sundberg 2007 *Risk v Northern Territory of Australia [2007] fcafc 46* Federal Court of Australia
- Fry, Norman 2007 Letter to Governing Committee, Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation, re Larrakia Development Corporation. Darwin, 8 November, 2007.
- Gray, Ian 2000 The Kenbi (Cox Peninsula) Land Claim no 37: Report and recommendation of the former Aboriginal Land Commissioner, Justice Gray.
- Hansard 2008.
- Henderson, Krimhilde 1984 *History of Kulaluk*. Aboriginal sacred Sites Authority.
- Herbert, Xavier 1938 *Capricornia*. Sydney: Angus and Robertson.
- Jackson, Donna 2008 *Media Release, 9th May 2008*. Darwin: Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation.
- Kearney, W J 1984 *Nicholson River (Waanyi/Garawa) Land Claim: report by the Aboriginal Land Commissioner*. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.
- Kearney, W J 1988 *Jawoyn (Katherine area) land claim: report by the Aboriginal Land Commissioner*. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.
- Larrakia Development Corporation 2009 Website <http://www.larrakia.com.au/>
- Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation 2007 Letter to Norman Fry, Executive Director, NLC, Darwin, 24 October, 2007.
- Lockwood, Douglas 1960 *Fair Dinkum*. London: The Companion Book Club.
- Lockwood, Douglas 1966 *Australia's Pearl Harbour: Darwin 1942*. Adelaide: Rigby.
- Lockwood, Douglas 1968 *The Front Door: Darwin 1869-1969*. Adelaide: Rigby.
- McNally, Ward 1974 *The Angry Australians*. Canterbury, Victoria: Scope Publishing.
- Mansfield, J 2006 *Risk v Northern Territory of Australia [2006] fca 404* Federal Court of Australia Corrigendum.

- Murphy, Peter 2009 Larrakia Coming of Age: Kenbi land claim deal a watershed for Top End development. *Sunday Territorian*, February 8, 2009, p. 20.
- Olney, H W 1991 *Kenbi (Cox Peninsula) land claim: findings and report of the Aboriginal Land Commissioner*. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.
- Ring, Graham 2008 Black and White: Profiling people working in our community, Donna Jackson 'Caring for Country in the Top End', *National Indigenous Times*, October 2, 2008.
- Sansom, Basil 1980 *The camp at Wallaby Cross: Aboriginal fringe dwellers in Darwin*. Canberra: Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies.
- Sansom, Basil 2001 'In the absence of vita as genre: the making of the Roy Kelly story'. In *Telling stories: indigenous history and memory in Australia and New Zealand*. B Attwood and F Magowan, eds. Pp.99-122. Crows Nest, NSW: Allen and Unwin.
- Stanner, W E H 1933-4 Ceremonial economics of the Mulluk-mulluk and Madngella tribes of the Daly River, North Australia, *Oceania*, Vol 4.
- Sutton, Peter 1998 *Native title and the descent of rights*. Perth: National Native Title Tribunal.
- Tonkinson, R 1978 *The cultural roots of Aboriginal land rights*. Seminar paper given in the Research school of Pacific Studies, Australian National University, Canberra, November 1978.
- Toohey, J 1981 *Finniss River land claim: report by the Aboriginal Land Commissioner*. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.
- Toohey, J 1982 *Daly River (Malak Malak) land claim*. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.
- Walsh, Michael 1989a *Ten years on: a supplement to the 1979 Kenbi land claim book*. Darwin: Northern Land Council.
- Walsh, Michael 1989b *Supplement to Ten years on*. Darwin: Northern Land Council.
- Wells, Samantha (ed) 2001 *Saltwater People: Larrakia Stories from around Darwin*. Darwin: Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation.

Endnotes:

¹ According to Wikipedia: 'Aikido is a Japanese martial art developed by Morihei Ueshiba as a synthesis of his martial studies, philosophy, and religious beliefs. Aikido is often translated as 'the Way of unifying (with) life energy' or as "the Way of harmonious spirit."'

² Wells (2001:187) writes in glowing terms: 'In 2001, Florrie Odegaard Devine formally passed on her seniority in the [Cubillo] family to her eldest son, Richard Barnes Koolpinyah. Florence did this in recognition of his many years of pro-active work in re-establishing Larrakia culture and the fact that her advancing years prevented her from being as active in Larrakia matters as she has been in the past.' Wells (2001:187) then adds: 'Richard and his cousin Steve Cubillo, have assisted in putting this Cubillo family history chapter together: Much of the family information presented [in the chapter] has been drawn from the tireless work of Richard and Steve's cousin, Inez Cubillo Carter.'

³ Richard Barnes is listed by AAPA with Helen Secretary, Billy Risk, Tibby Quall and Kathleen Presley Minyimma as a custodian of the One Mile Dam 'Barramundi site' 5073-115, 'a spring where the underground water surfaces'.

⁴ The full genealogy appears in Gray (2000:43). He states: Christina married Oliver Odegaard. Their five children are Leo Odegaard, Florence Devine, Joe Odegaard, Keith Slape and Elsa Heron. Leo Odegaard has six children, Christina, Evonne, Lynette, Donna, David and Gladys Odegaard.

⁵ Brandl and Walsh (1983:152) relate the same connections to the Cubillo family with a slight variation being the description of Munggalu as 'the most knowledgeable man of the area today'. According to Cubillo-Carter (2000:142) Jack Mc Keddie died in 1939 and Lily Cubillo died in 1935.

⁶ A 'List of Half Casts [sic] in the Northern Territory' lists 'Jack - male, 7 years, mother - Maggie, Mother's tribe - South Port, Reputed father's name - G McKeddie' and Remarks: 'Half cast Jack lives with the blacks on P R Allen's premises, he is poorly grown, appears to be well fed and a fair amount of clothing.' NTRS - 790, A 10441, Document 238.

⁷ NTRS - 790, A 10441, Document 238.

⁸ NTRS – 790, A 10441, Document 238. A public notice in the *Northern Territory Times and Gazette* on 6th February, 1886, announced the business partnership between George McKeddie and P R Allen (Cubillo-Carter 2000:16).

⁹ Mansfield (2006:157) comments: ‘In relation to the List of Half Castes, and the entries contained therein, Dr Walsh said that it was his understanding, from Richard Barnes, that Annie Duwun was also known as ‘Minnie’. Mansfield (2006:154) records that the McLennan family are the descendants of a Larrakia woman named Minnie Lily, who married a European man, John McLennan. This does not appear to be the same ‘Minnie @ Annie’ referred to by Richard Barnes. Mansfield (2006:154) continues: ‘Dr Walsh estimated that Minnie Lily was born towards the end of the nineteenth century. Their children were William McLennan and Cygnet Ada McLennan’.

¹⁰ For background on Roy Kelly, see Sansom (2001) ‘In the absence of vita as genre: the making of the Roy Kelly story’. In *Telling stories: indigenous history and memory in Australia and New Zealand*. B Attwood and F Magowan, eds. Pp.99-122. Also Day (2001). Roy Kelly is given the pseudonym ‘Tommy Atkins’ in Sansom’s *The camp at Wallaby Cross* (1980).

¹¹ The Aboriginal population records are available on the internet, CA 7112 ATSI Northern Territory State Office. There are noticeable errors in identifying some individual’s language group identity.

¹² A ‘List of Half Casts [sic] in the Northern Territory’ lists ‘Lilly, female, 14 years, Mother’s name - Minnie, Mother’s tribe - South Port, Reputed father’s name - G McKeddie’. Under ‘Remarks’ the list states: ‘Half cast Lilly is living with a Manila man named Antonio at the old ice house on the beach, She appears to be well fed and clothed for further particulars see report.’ NTRS – 790, A 10441, Document 238.

¹³ Also see Wells (2001) pages 102, 131, 173 for mentions of Vicki Dashwood.

¹⁴ Barnes said that he organised a ceremony that cleared his deceased uncle’s name, allowing it to be spoken.

¹⁵ In a footnote on the same page the anthropologist notes: ‘Richard Barnes maintained Annie Duwun had been born at Belyuen (3055)’ (p.140).

¹⁶ Aboriginal Areas Protection Authority

¹⁷ Emery Point Goondal, Series E1508, File Number 4/530, p.39. National Archives of Australia.

¹⁸ Tommy Lyons’ daughter Olga could not have inherited her father’s rights to a men’s site and Norman Harris had no children. However, the Williams family and other Batcho descendants maintain their Larrakia connection.

¹⁹ Interview between George Mungulow and myself [John Wilders] on 1st July, 1975 at 11.15am. Emery Point 1, Series E1132/1, National Archives of Australia.

²⁰ The area for parliament house was outside the restricted area according to the two elders.

²¹ Interview between Norman Harris and myself [J Wilders] in the presence of J Guyabaka and Fred Fogarty’s wife on 3/7/75 at 9.15am. Emery Point 1, Series E1132/1, National Archives of Australia.

²² Statement by the speaker of the Legislative Assembly on the Aboriginal land claim to the area known as Goondal. Emery Point 1, Series E1132/1, National Archives of Australia.

²³ Addition to an earlier submission by Gwalwa Daraniki Association for an area known as Goondal. W B Day. Emery Point 1, Series E1132/1, National Archives of Australia.

²⁴ See Walsh (1989b)

²⁵ ‘Delfin Antonio Cubillo who is the “Keeper of Stories”, 8th grandchild of George McKeddie and Annie (Duwun), 8th child of the 10 Cubillo children. (Something privileged – Larrakia name of ‘Belyuen’ was bestowed on Delfin to tie him into the land across the harbour by a Senior Larrakia Ceremony Man, George Munguloo on the 8th September 1984). Delfin died 8th March 1986 (Cubillo-Carter:1996:204).

²⁶ According to *Keeper of the Stories* (Cubillo-Carter 2000:140) ‘great grand father [George] McKeddie made regular trips to Delissavillie and a second child Jack was born 1892 ... Delissaville was the McKeddie’s home away from home well before Delissaville was given to him in a Land Grant in 1927.

²⁷ The genealogy in the Kenbi Claim Book (Brandl et al 1979:41) shows Johnny and Roy Mudpul as the sons of George’s unnamed deceased brother.

²⁸ Undoubtedly there are many significant sites on Koolpinya Station. The Herbert brothers were said to have wished the station would go to its Aboriginal inhabitants on their death, but the transfer never occurred.. Barnes does not discuss the significance of his name ‘Koolpinya’ except to suggest that he is named after Roy Edwards’s (Munggalu’s boss) Koolpinya butcher shop that once traded in Darwin’s CBD.

²⁹ A photograph of the hut and names painted on it appears in *We have bugger all: the Kulaluk story* by Cheryl Buchanan, AUS, 1974.

³⁰ See: Transcript of discussion Kulaluk Darwin, Northern Territory-02 June 1973. National Archives of Australia, Series A4257, 2 PART 8.

³¹ See: Gwalwa Daraniki [Association] series of correspondence, National Archives of Australia, Series A4252, Control 33.

³² As above.

³³ Topsy Secretary's Larrakia genealogy is available in a digital format in 'Gwalwa Daraniki (Association) series of correspondence', Series A4252, Control 33, National Archives of Australia website.

³⁴ Read a description of this event in Day (1994:100-101) and comments by Henderson (1984).

³⁵ 'Darwinians will not lose their homes – Larrakia', *Land Rights News*, August 1994, page 5.

³⁶ The address given for the LAC is 10 Creswell St, Tiwi, NT 0810 (ORIC).

³⁷ Richard Barnes played no part in the formation of the Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation.

³⁸ Letter from NLC to Larrakia Nation Aboriginal Corporation, 5 November, 2007.

³⁹ As above.

⁴⁰ 'Thirty-Year Title Fight settled', Saturday Extra, *NT News*, January 31, 2009, p.19-20.

⁴¹ Peter Murphy (2009) explains:

In the case of Kenbi, the existence of the LDC allowed the Northern Land Council, the legal guardian of Aboriginal land rights in the Top End, to sign off on a deal which leaves approximately 15,000 ha of Aboriginal land as freehold instead of inalienable freehold title, which is harder to utilise in modern market terms.

⁴² 'Larrakia trades take shape', *NT News* July 15, 2009.

⁴³ 'Larrakia seniors get extra cash', *NT News*, July 10, 2009.

⁴⁴ See also 'Larrakia backs plan for new gas plant in Harbour', *NT News*, May 9, 2008.

⁴⁵ See 'Gas plant location squabble', *NT News*, May 10, 2008.

⁴⁶ See also 'Larrakia Nation against Inpex deal', *NT News*, September 28, 2008.

⁴⁷ 'Darwin's Traditional Owners reject plans for harbour plants', October 2008.

⁴⁸ As above.

⁴⁹ The *NT News* columnist Peter Murphy (Murphy 2009) has admitted that he was once employed by the LDC.

⁵⁰ Felix Holmes can be seen on the video of the book launch for *Bunji: a story of the Gwalwa Daraniki Movement* (Day 1996) singing to didgeridoo playing by Prince of Wales and Horace Walawala. Davis (1994) describes Felix as 'senior custodian of the Limilngan Tribe'. In 1975 Norman Barral Harris told the NLC Secretary that he was 'level' with George Munggalu. Norman participated in the Larrakia struggle from the start until his death.

⁵¹ As used by Lockwood (1966:123), a 'factotum' is a person employed to do a large number of different jobs, although the relationship between Munggalu and the Edwards family seems to resemble the relationship between a devoted slave and his master.

⁵² George died in 1985. Delfin died in 1986

⁵³ The 'bestowal' was said to occur in September 1984. Bobby Secretary died in November 1984 and George Munggalu in 1985.